

**SPECIAL MEETING SUMMARIZED MINUTES  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

**December 1, 2005**

**5:00 p.m.**



**Final Plans Conference Rooms, First Floor, One Civic Center  
7506 E. Indian School Road, Scottsdale, Arizona**

**CALL TO ORDER**

Chairman Wimmer called the special meeting to order at 5:05 p.m.

**ATTENDANCE**

**Present:**

Ed Wimmer, Chairman  
George Hartz, Vice-Chairman  
Nancy Dallett  
Dezbah Hatathli  
Kathy Howard  
Paul Winslow

**Absent:**

Lisa Loss

**Staff:**

Debbie Abele  
Don Meserve  
Don Hadder, Sr.

**Also Present:**

Bob Mather, Architect  
Roger Brevoort, Architect

**1. INTRODUCTIONS AND ROLL CALL/ MINUTES**

The presence of Commissioners as shown above was noted.

**2. MINUTES**

Commissioner Dallett requested that the following comment be added to the November minutes:

NOTE IN ACCORDANCE WITH PROVISIONS OF THE ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES, THE SUMMARIZED MINUTES OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETINGS ARE NOT VERBATIM TRANSCRIPTS, ONLY THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND DISCUSSION APPEARING WITH QUOTATION MARKS ARE VERBATIM.

"Commissioner Dallett commented on the letter from Commissioner Howard that was made a part of the record. She indicated that she agreed with Commissioner Howard on several things and shared her concerns about Taliesin's future. However, she states that she is also aware of the limitations of the HP designation alone to effectively shape its preservation.

Commissioner Dallett states that she disagrees that the Commission established 'convenient, narrowly defined HP boundaries.' To the contrary, the Commission approached the situation with a great deal of care and thoroughness. She indicates that the boundaries are narrow for two reasons: one, the Commission was bound to an agreement that insisted the boundaries be mutually agreed upon; and two, the parties could agree to the limited boundaries because safeguards are in place due to the fact that the Commission will take part in the Special Campus zoning process. She further indicates that Taliesin is in a period of change and the Commission has built in a two-year period to revisit the issue, at which time the Commission can determine whether the current boundaries should be adjusted.

Commissioner Dallett states that if the Commission fails to initiate, she believes they will have been derelict in their charge. She states that the overriding goal is to place Taliesin on the Scottsdale Historic Register; therefore it is important to act now. She indicates that the Commission will move on to insuring that historic preservation components of the Special Campus zoning will be a powerful tool for protecting the historic property and its view sheds."

Commissioner Howard requested that changes to the November minutes be made as follows:

In her letter dated November 9, 2005, that was made part of the record, in paragraph one following the verbiage "...who built Ancala West," Commissioner Howard requested that the language "...and Cactus Gates" be added.

**CHAIRMAN WIMMER MOVED THE APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE NOVEMBER 10, 2005 MEETING. THE MOTION WAS SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER \_\_\_\_\_. THE MOTION IS CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY BY A VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).**

### **3. REVIEW/APPROVE: HISTORIC RESIDENTIAL EXTERIOR REHAB PROGRAM APPLICATION MATERIALS**

Ms. Abele described the Historic Residential Exterior Rehabilitation Program Guidelines and the 2006 application materials distributed by Mr. Meserve. Ms. Abele discussed the project criteria and qualifications for approval of submitted applications. Ms. Abele stated that mailings would be accomplished shortly after the approval of the guidelines and application forms from the Commission.

Ms. Abele indicated that staff is working with the legal department to write associated legal agreements for the program for those applicants who are selected. She indicated that they are attempting to write the legal agreements so that they read simply. She further indicated that they are attempting to eliminate the need to have a consent decree signed by any lenders for the properties.

Ms. Abele addressed the concern of foreclosure on properties. She indicated that the life of the Conservation Easements would be in relation to the life of the improvement for which they were offered.

Ms. Abele indicated that a half-day workshop would occur on January 14, 2006. She indicated that the on-call architectural firms would be present to offer assistance to any homeowner who

requests help on their improvement plans. She stated that attending the workshop is not a requirement for submitting an application, but is advisable. Ms. Abele indicated that the workshop would assist applicants in completing applications and understanding the process.

Commissioner Dallett suggested that those applicants who attend the workshop should be given special consideration during the application review process. In response, Commissioner Winslow indicated that some projects are simplistic enough that the workshop would not offer any advantage to them, indicating that it could be more of a hindrance to the applicant.

Ms. Abele discussed the timeline. She indicated that the workshop will be held on January 14, 2006, applications will be due on February 1, 2006; applications will be given to the rehabilitation selection committee within 24 to 48 hours, allowing for a two week review and selection process. She suggested an HPC meeting on the 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of February to obtain Commission approval of the selected applicants in order to be prepared to submit the applications to City Council for funding.

Ms. Abele indicated that there would be a second opportunity for residents to apply for the rehab program in 2006 with an application deadline of September 1, 2006.

Chairman Wimmer questioned how the review and selection panel would decide which applications would be approved. In response, Commissioner Winslow indicated that the decision making process will initially be more subjective. Ms. Abele described the process in detail, stating that the panel will read the applications, and then rank the projects in the order that they would like to see funded.

Discussion ensued regarding the review and selection process.

Commissioner Dallett stated that it was a great idea to include replacing citrus trees as an allowable project expense. However, she expressed concerns about the conflict with other City programs promoting water conservation if the Commission were to allow for the funding of irrigation systems for citrus. In response, Ms. Abele indicated that funding would not be offered for irrigation systems and that residents would be encouraged plant two citrus trees per front yard.

Discussion ensued regarding the language of the project selection criteria as listed in the Historic Residential Exterior Rehabilitation Program Guidelines. Discussion ensued regarding whether applicants would be required to hire a licensed contractor in order to receive consideration for approval of their application.

Commissioner Winslow indicated that preference might be given to those who do use a licensed contractor, unless the applicant had experience in the area of construction or architectural design. Experienced homeowners could do work themselves.

Commissioner Hartz expressed concern about the requirement of submitting six additional copies along with the original application and attachments. In response, Ms. Abele clarified that copies of the attachments will not be required. The application document will be rewritten to clarify the submittal requirements.

Commissioner Hartz suggested adding verbiage to define "conservation easement" since many residents will not be familiar with the term or what this requirement means. Discussion ensued regarding the definition of conservation easement, as well as how it applies to the application process.

**COMMISSIONER WINSLOW MOVED TO PROCEED WITH THE FINALIZATION OF THE HISTORIC RESIDENTIAL EXTERIOR REHABILITATION PROGRAM GUIDELINES AND APPLICATION. COMMISSIONERMAN HARTZ SECONDED THE MOTION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY BY A VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).**

Mr. Meserve indicated that projects that are currently under construction would not be eligible for the application process. He further stated that applications would be considered for work that is phased to begin after the selection process is completed.

Commissioner Wimmer indicated that the Commission recently approved three improvement plans for Certificates of Appropriateness. He stated that those applications would be considered for the rehab program if the applicants deferred the start of construction on their projects. Mr. Meserve confirmed.

Commissioner Wimmer asked for clarification on the availability of the applications. In response, Mr. Meserve indicated that applications would be posted online, as well as printed and made available at City locations. A mailing will be done soon to all 317 owners in the two historic districts to inform residents that applications are now being accepted for the program.

#### **4. REVIEW/POSSIBLE APPROVAL: DRAFT PRESERVATION GUIDELINES FOR VILLAGE GROVE 1-6 AND TOWN AND COUNTRY SCOTTSDALE**

##### **TOWN AND COUNTRY**

Ms. Abele informed the Commission that two on-call architectural firms were retained to assist in the preparation of the new Preservations Guidelines for Town and Country, and Village Grove neighborhood historic districts. She indicated that the Commission would be asked for comments on both draft guidelines but that approval would not be sought at this meeting.

Ms. Abele reported that Westlake Reed Leskosky has incorporated Green Building Guidelines into the Preservation Guidelines for Town and Country Scottsdale.

Mr. Mather, architect from Westlake Reed Leskosky distributed the initial draft of the Preservation Guidelines for Town and Country Scottsdale. He discussed the various ways that the firm approached the process, indicating that they visited the neighborhood to view the buildings designed by Ralph Haver, architect.

Mr. Mather described the various chapters of the draft version of the Preservation Guidelines for Town and Country Scottsdale. Green Building guidelines or recommendations are shown in the draft in *italics*. Ms. Abele detailed various pages of the draft version of the Preservation Guidelines for Town and Country, Scottsdale. She indicated where line drawings might be used in lieu of photographs of actual homes in the neighborhood.

Mr. Brevoort, architect from Westlake Reed Leskosky discussed various ways to illustrate the various remodel/reconstruction items that the Preservation Guidelines would potentially discourage, as well as the design resolution to those items. He gave bad design examples such as the addition of arches, major changes in surface textures, inappropriate carport enclosures, and the addition of second floors on a Haver home.

Commissioner Winslow questioned whether there might be a conflict between preservation goals and green building goals. As an example, he stated that although foam roofing is energy

efficient, it would not be a good solution for a Haver home in that it would not maintain the integrity of the Haver style by keeping a sharp straight line at the front edge of the roof. Discussion ensued regarding various alternatives to foam roofing to maintain a straight edge on the roof.

Commissioner Dallett questioned how the firm would determine when to use photographs rather than line drawings. Mr. Mather indicated that the use of the line drawings or photos would be based on the Commission's preference. He stated that some photos currently used in the draft version to illustrate bad examples were of homes not located in Town and Country Scottsdale, further stating that the line drawings would be more indicative of the homes in Town and Country Scottsdale.

Discussion ensued regarding when to use photographs and line drawings, followed by discussion regarding various options for window shading devices and how to illustrate those.

Mr. Brevoort discussed the various character-defining features of a Haver home.

Ms. Abele requested that the Commission review the draft document for final approval at the January 12, 2006 meeting. She further requested that Commission members email her with any suggestions for changes to the document by December 19th.

Commissioner Wimmer thanked Mr. Mather and Mr. Brevoort for taking the time to offer their presentation on Town and Country Scottsdale.

## **VILLAGE GROVE**

Ms. Abele distributed Draft Village Grove Historic District Preservation Guidelines for comment. She indicated that photos and illustrations would be added at a later date, as well as a glossary of terms. Ms. Abele described the various changes made to Don Ryden's earlier draft by Preservation staff, based upon the suggestions from the Commission at the previous meeting.

Ms. Abele suggested adding a chapter relating to home additions. She indicated a section on additions may be more convenient than having to review each chapter for the individual elements put into the addition, i.e. windows, doors, façade, etc.

Ms. Abele requested that the Commission review the Village Grove Guidelines and offer comments over the next two weeks. She noted that she would like to present the final draft for approval at the January 12, 2006 Commission meeting.

Chairman Wimmer expressed concern regarding the fact that the Village Grove Guidelines are not in the same format as the Town and Country Guidelines. In response, Ms. Abele indicated that the current draft of the Village Grove Guidelines is for text review only; format will be considered after submission of changes from the Commission. She further indicated that staff would develop a consistent format for the two documents and that the final versions of the two guidelines will become the template for all future guideline documents.

Mr. Meserve reminded the Commission that the draft distributed for Village Grove included just chapters one through five from the Table of Contents. He stated that chapters six through eight would be distributed to the Commission via email as soon as Ms. Abele has completed a revised draft of these chapters.

## **5. REPORT/DISCUSSION: TALIESIN WEST DESIGNATION UPDATE**

Mr. Hadder, Principle Planner for the City of Scottsdale offered an update on the Special Campus rezoning request for Taliesin West being prepared by the Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation, owner. He reported that there has been some restructuring within the Foundation board of directors in 2005. He further indicated that it could be about September 2006 before the City Council holds a hearing concerning the Special Campus rezoning application.

Mr. Hadder anticipates open houses may occur sometime around April or May 2006. The Special Campus application may not contain a great deal of detail on the master plans so that it will be conducive to the needs of Taliesin West for the next 25 to 30 years. Mr. Hadder indicated that the historic preservation overlay zoning process would probably be completed before the Foundation begins their public involvement process.

Mr. Meserve explained that Mr. Hadder was present at this meeting because Mr. Gawf, Assistant City Manager indicated at the previous meeting that City Staff would like the opportunity to report back to the Commission after meeting with the Foundation to discuss the relationship between the schedules for the HP and SC cases.

Mr. Meserve indicated that the first open house would occur at Mustang Library on Saturday, December 3, 2005. A second open house has been scheduled in the Nave of the Community Design Studio on January 12, 2006. Mr. Meserve stated that notices were sent to 300+ residents surrounding the Taliesin West property and that a white sign has been posted at the entrance of Taliesin West indicating the times, dates and locations for the two open houses. He extended an invitation to the Commissioners to attend the open houses.

Mr. Meserve distributed a list of meetings, field trips or correspondence on Taliesin West that led to the initiation of the HP overlay zoning case by the Commission in November.

## **6. HPO/STAFF PROGRESS REPORTS/DISCUSSION**

Ms. Abele indicated that the Commission should have any suggestions for revising the Preservation Guidelines submitted to her by December 19, 2005.

Ms. Abele reported that the street sign installation ceremonies for Village Grove and Town and Country are tentatively scheduled for January 21, 2006, but will be dependent on the delivery date of the signs.

Ms. Abele has contacted a representative from Hotel Valley Ho in order to request a conference room for the January Retreat.

Mr. Meserve noted that a February 8, 2005 joint meeting with the Planning Commission would be held in the KIVA at City Hall beginning at 3:30 p.m. Ms. Abele suggested that the Commission discuss the orchestration of the joint meeting with the Planning Commission at the retreat.

Ms. Abele distributed a Citizen Bibliography prepared by Ian Johnson, intern related to Ranch House history and style. The document will be added to the City website. She further indicated that the various references in the document would be assembled and kept in a historic preservation library for public use.

Ms. Abele distributed an invitation for the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions (NAPC) Forum to be held July 27 through 30, 2006.

Mr. Meserve informed the Commission of the invitation to participate in the Parada del Sol Parade, indicating that, if the Commission would like to again participate in the parade, he would like to RSVP soon.

Discussion ensued regarding participation in the parade, as well as design of the wagon that would be used by the Commission. The Commission indicated their interest in participating in this year's parade and for inviting the Scottsdale Historical Society to join them on the Commission's entry.

Mr. Meserve indicated that the OLPH Mission Church is applying for another Heritage Grant for funding for additional work on restoring the church on Brown Avenue.

## **7. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Chairman Wimmer announced that he was asked by a representative of the Arizona Republic to comment on possible future participation of the Commission in various projects. He stated that if members of the media contact any members of the Commission in the future, the best response to questions regarding future projects would be to indicate that further study by the Commission is needed at this time.

Chairman Wimmer suggested that discussion of future designations and projects should be held at the January retreat. Mr. Meserve suggested that discussion be held regarding the other 1950s neighborhoods that are slated for register consideration.

Discussion ensued regarding an article in the newspaper that discussed the OLPH Mission Church, which is listed on the Scottsdale Historic Register. Commissioner Hartz expressed disappointment that neither the HPC nor the church being listed on the local register was mentioned in the article. It was suggested that the reporters should be more informed about the Commission's involvement in the project, as well as future projects. Mr. Meserve stated that he would contact Mike Phillips, the City's media liaison, in order to inform the reporter of errors or omissions in the article.

Chairman Wimmer stated that the best policy would be to avoid print publicity due to the fact that there have been several errors made by local newspapers in past articles.

Commissioner Hartz suggested that the best solution would be for the City's Media Relations employee to contact the writer in order to acquaint him/her with the Commission as a City resource.

## **8. PUBLIC COMMENTS**

None.

## **9. FUTURE MEETINGS AND AGENDA ITEMS**

The December 8<sup>th</sup> HPC meeting has been cancelled.

Open House for Taliesin at Mustang Library Auditorium will be held December 3, 2005.

Regularly scheduled HPC Meeting will be held January 12, 2006, with an Open House for Taliesin West HP zoning from 4:00-5:30 p.m. preceding the meeting.

Historic Residential Rehabilitation Workshop will be held January 14, 2006.

HPC retreat will be held January 28, 2006.

Joint meeting with Planning Commission will be held February 8, 2006.

The February 9<sup>th</sup> HPC meeting has been canceled. The Commission can meet after the joint meeting.

Special meeting of the HPC for the consideration and/or approval of rehab program applications will be held on February 23, 2006.

Regularly scheduled HPC meeting will be held March 9, 2006.

City Council meeting on Taliesin West HP zoning tentatively scheduled for March 21, 2006.

#### **10. ADJOURNMENT**

There being no other business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 6:54 p.m.

SUBMITTED BY:

REVIEWED BY:

AV-Tronics, Inc.

Ed Wimmer, Chair

Officially approved by the Historic Preservation Commission on \_ .